THE EDUCATION FUND

FOR EXCELLENCE IN MIAMI-DADE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

2018-2019

Ideas with IMPACT

idea packet

sponsored by:

ASSURANT

The Art of Arguing

“The Art of Arguing”

By Stacy Mogull
6th grade ELA Teacher/ 5th-8th grade ELA Coach
Aventura City of Excellence School
smogull@aventuracharter.org

For information concerning Ideas with IMPACT opportunities including Adapter and Disseminator grants, please contact: Debra Alamo, Interim Program Manager Ideas with IMPACT The Education Fund 305-558-4544, Ext. 105 Email: dalamo@educationfund.org www.educationfund.org

Table of Contents

Goals	Page 3
Florida Standards Addressed	Page 4
Course Overview	Page 5
Lesson Plans	Page 6
Graphic Organizers	Pages 7-11
Rubrics	Pages 12-15
Examples	Pages 16-18

Goals

- Help students support an argument in an engaging way
- Encourage students to plan and organize their thoughts
- Support the idea that multiple ideas are right as long as there is evidence to back it up
- Address the needs of various learning styles
- Foster a class community by teaching ways to respond respectfully
- Reinforce purposeful listening
- Strengthen argumentative/opinion writing
- Informally assess individual students' needs to master various standards
- Increase ability for students to incorporate insight to the evidence in their argument

Florida Standards

LAFS.K12.R.1.1: Read closely to determine what the text says explicitly and to make logical inferences from it; cite specific textual evidence when writing or speaking to support conclusions drawn from the text.

LAFS.K12.R.2.5: Analyze the structure of texts, including how specific sentences, paragraphs, and larger portions of the text (e.g., a section, chapter, scene, or stanza) relate to each other and the whole.

LAFS.K12.R.3.8: Delineate and evaluate the argument and specific claims in a text, including the validity of the reasoning as well as the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence.

LAFS.K12.W.1.1: Write arguments to support claims in an analysis of substantive topics or texts, using valid reasoning and relevant and sufficient evidence.

LAFS.K12.SL.1.1: Prepare for and participate effectively in a range of conversations and collaborations with diverse partners, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly and persuasively.

LAFS.K12.SL.1.3: Evaluate a speaker's point of view, reasoning, and use of evidence and rhetoric.

LAFS.K12.SL.2.4: Present information, findings, and supporting evidence such that listeners can follow the line of reasoning and the organization, development, and style are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience.

Course Overview

Purpose: By debating, students are able to practice offering their opinions (elementary) and arguments (secondary). Since some students are reluctant writers, it is often hard to distinguish students that are not able to provide their opinion/argument and those who struggle to put it down on paper. Students that either do not enjoy writing or who are not proficient can still succeed and master various standards. After a debate, it is typically easy to see which students need more support with the formation of their opinions/arguments.

Outline:

- Students dive into the resources provided and evaluate what evidence is helpful to their given question/topic
- Students complete a graphic organizer for both sides of the debate
- The teacher will randomly split the class between the sides
- To prepare for the debate, students will add their personal insight about the evidence found by making inferences
- Before the debate, give reminders for debate procedures and respectful listening
- Students will get a chance to vocalize their viewpoint on a given topic and become better listeners in the process, while staying engaged with the lesson
- Optional-- students not included in the debate, can fill out a listening web and help determine debate winner

Materials:

- Articles or texts that will be the sources for the debate
- Graphic organizer for each students

Sample Lesson Plans

Day 1: Students are given a text and will text code for a given purpose that will help them understand the main idea. An example would be a text that discusses the upsides and downsides of technology. Students would create a key and then text code for the pros and cons of children utilizing technology. The teacher will be modeling and students will be following.

Day 2: Students will be presented with another text on the same topic and will again text code for the pros and cons of utilizing technology. This time, the students will work in groups and the teacher will monitor.

Day 3 (Optional): Students will be presented with an argumentative essay or piece of writing that incorporates a skillful variety of transitions. Students will go on a transition hunt, highlighting the various transitions found. Then, they will categorize the transitions on a separate organizer. Students will be able to use this transition graphic organizer on the debate day. This will also reinforce having a claim, evidence, and insight in the debate.

Day 4: Students will evaluate their text coding to find the best evidence for both sides of the debate. Have students write the debate topic on their debate web and then use the sources to fill out. They should write the source next to each piece of evidence. Students should use both sources (or as many as they are able) on their web. They will leave the claim area blank until they find out which stance they are assigned. They will out any insight based on the evidence at the bottom.

Day 5: Let students know which stance they will take. Give students about eight minutes to prepare by reviewing their web. They should create a claim and add any additional insight. Decide how long you want the debate to be and let students know. Start a timer to keep track. It is the teacher's discretion on how to have students speak. Students can raise their hand when they are interested in speaking and the teacher can call on those students interested that have not yet had a turn. You could also just let the students decide when they are able to participate. If you decide to have 2 separate debates, the group not debating should have a listening web to fill out. At the end of the debate, have the students listening vote on the winner by the amount of evidence they gathered.

Graphic Organizers

The graphic organizers in this section can be used to have students evaluate the sources, find evidence to support their given topic, and to listen purposefully to those speaking.

The first organizer was used with middle school students for the debate. Students should prepare both sides of the debate organizer so they go into the debate knowing what the other side might say to strengthen their defense. Once given the side, students should create their claim.

The second organizer is the listening web used with middle school students. If you decide to split up your class into two separate debates to minimalize the amount of students taking the same stance, the group not debating can listen and fill out to help determine the winner. This gives them a purpose for listening and the responsibility of gathering evidence given.

The third organizer is one modified for 4th and 5th grade students. It is similar to the first organizer, just simplified.

The last organizer is if you choose to have students categorize great transitions found in essays. I allow students to have this out during every debate to reinforce using a skillful variety of transitions when speaking (or writing).

Debate/Argument Web

Issue/Topic:

Claim:

Arguments for

Arguments against

Additional insight:

Additional insight:

Debate Listening Web

Issue/Topic:

Arguments for _____

Arguments against _____

Conclusions: Who won debate and why?

Opinion Debate Web

Issue/Topic:

Arguments for _____

Arguments against _____

Any additional key points:

Categorized Transitions

To add information:	To sequence ideas:
To compare:	To contrast:
To conclude/summarize:	To intensify/clarify:
To provide an example:	To show emotion:
To show cause:	To show effect:

Rubrics

Various rubrics can be used depending on the items/standards you would like to assess. Attached are some sample rubrics. The language utilized is similar to the FSA Writing Rubric.

The first rubric is very thorough and assesses transitions as well as the listening web sheet. This rubric is great to use once all expectations have been set and students have already drafted an argumentative/opinion essay. Typically, this rubric is used twice a year. Students have a full class period to complete the debate graphic organizer to be thoroughly prepared for the debate.

The second rubric is much simpler and is great to utilize for quicker debates throughout the year. This rubric is utilized about once or twice a month and does not need as much preparation time.

The third rubric has been modified to be used with 3rd and 4th graders getting adjusted to speaking their opinions.

Opinion Debate and Listening Rubric

Name_____ Period_____ Unit_____

	1	2	3	4
Debate Focus	Does not state point	Attempts to state point	States point	States point clearly and does not digress
Debate: Organization/ transitional devices	Few or no transitional strategies	Inconsistent use of transitional strategies, simple vocab	Adequate use of transitional strategies. Appropriate tone, some mature vocab	Skillful use of a variety of transitional strategies, logical progression from beginning to end, appropriate style and tone with mature vocab
Debate: Text evidence/ support for first point	Minimal, absent, or irrelevant evidence	Limited evidence to support claim, weakly integrated or irrelevant references	Adequate relevant evidence from source to support claim, reference may be general	Thorough, relevant, and convincing evidence from a source to support claim, precise references, insight
Debate: Text evidence/ support (additional support)	Minimal, absent, or irrelevant evidence	Limited evidence to support claim, weakly integrated or irrelevant references	Adequate relevant evidence from source to support claim, reference may be general	Thorough, relevant, and convincing evidence from a source to support claim, precise references, insight
Listening Debate Web	No/minimal components of the web	Has some of the key components on the web	Has most of the key points on web	Has all key points from debate on web
Argument web/planning sheet	No/minimal attempt at a plan	Missing several components, might be vague	Missing a few components, not as extensive as it could be	Has all components clear/extensive- opinion, middles, source, evidence, insight,

24 pts	100%	19 pts	79%	14 pts	58%
23 pts	96%	18 pts	75%	13 pts	54%
22 pts	92%	17 pts	71%	12 pts	50%
21 pts	88%	16 pts	67%	11 pts	46%
20 pts	83%	15 pts	63%	10 pts	42%

Debate Grading Guide:

100%	80%	60%	40%	0
Student supported claim with relevant new evidence and thorough insight, included source, purposeful contribution	Student supported claim with new evidence and some insight • but may not have provided source • may have repeated evidence • insight may not have been clear	Student supported claim • repeated evidence • gave minimal thoughts/ insight to debate • doesn't respond to previous point	Attempt to participate, but no additional thinking was provided	Does not participate

Speaking and Listening Rubric

Name_____ Date_____

	1	2	3	4
States a claim/thesis	No thesis/claim (just answers, maybe a "yes" or "no")	Attempt at thesis/claim (may answer question)	Claim/thesis used (includes use of "I" or "my")	Clear claim/thesis used (no "I")
Text evidence/ support	No evidence from text	Minimal evidence, but not enough to thoroughly support	Evidence is used without reference to location	Evidence is used purposely to answer question, location of evidence is provided
Quality of speaking	Hard to understand	Needs some improvement of volume, speed, intonation	Adequate volume, speed, intonation	Great volume, speed, intonation
Listening	Has difficulty being a respectful listener	Has some problems being a respectful listener	Minimally fidgets	A respectful listener

Examples

Sample articles from

- https://well.blogs.nytimes.com/2015/07/06/screen-addiction-is-taking-a-toll-on-children/
- https://parade.com/485609/scott_steinberg/5-reasons-that-technology-is-good-for-kids/ (one used in example below)

Page 17 has an example of text coding an article for the purpose of debating. It includes a key. Any text that can be argued can be utilized in this activity in its place. See Day 1 of lesson plan for more information.

Page 18 has an example of the debate web completed. This activity should be done after all sources have been text coded. See Day 4 of lesson plan for more information.

5 Reasons That Technology Is Good for Kids

Key
positives
negatives

By **SCOTT STEINBERG** | A Keynote Speaker

Given their vivid graphics, rich characters and backdrops, and often clear-cut mission objectives, it's not surprising that apps, video games and high-tech toys may give the initial impression of leaving little to the imagination. But in actuality, they're among the most successful tools that parents can tap into to encourage creativity and dynamic thinking, allowing children to experiment with situations, scenarios and approaches in safe, fun and inventive contexts.

In the right environment and with the right supervision and monitoring, kids can benefit greatly from interaction with technology. While children's enjoyment of popular apps and games is frequently viewed as a frivolous leisure activity, just as interactive play is a helpful cognitive tool for kids that promotes creativity, imagination and teamwork, so too can it also be a vital educational resource. Today, more children aged two to five can run applications and video games than ride a bike or tie their shoelaces – a fact which may frighten parents and educators. But it bears remembering that not only do many software options actively teach math, science, social studies and other useful topics. Even those which place entertainment first can be helpful educational aids when utilized correctly.

The next time you tell your students or children "Drop that device and do your homework!," it's worth considering – you may actually be doing them a disservice. Following are just a few of the many 21st century learning and career skills that today's leading electronic innovations teach:

Enhanced Learning and Retention

Studies show that a curriculum involving digital media can improve early literacy skills. Participating four and five year olds enjoyed boosts in letter recognition, sound association with letters, and understanding basic concepts about stories and print. However, it should be noted that gains were achieved through the use of high-quality educational titles – and that strong parental

Debate/Argument Web

Issue/Topic: Should children under 10 use technology?

Claim:

Arguments for tech

"encourage creativity and dynamic thinking... fun and inventive contexts." (5 Reasons)

quiet car rides for parents (screen addiction)

4-5 yr olds had "boosts in letter recognition, sound association" (5 Reasons)

"juggle multiple tasks simultaneously" (5 Reasons)

"adept at multitasking" (screen add)

Additional insight:

easier for parents on the go and will enable learning at early ages if children aren't exposed by parents

Arguments against tech

playing violent video games led to more aggressive behavior (screen add)

schoolwork and sleep suffer (screen add)

needs "right supervision and monitoring" (5 Reasons)

"more children aged 2 to 5 can run applications than ride a bike or tie shoelaces" (5 Reasons)

Additional insight:

many parents don't supervise and monitor their children closely

THE EDUCATION FUND
FOR EXCELLENCE IN MIAMI-DADE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

Contributors with IMPACT

Platium Star

FORD MOTOR COMPANY FUND

School District Education Foundation Matching Grant Program

FLORIDA EDUC8 SUPPORT EDUCATION

Gold Star

TD Bank America's Most Convenient Bank®

ASSURANT®

P L Dodge FOUNDATION

FPL

Iris Smith

Silver Star

Learning A-Z

PEREZ TRADING COMPANY

MBF Miami Bayside Foundation

Rod and Lucy Petrey

Bronze Star

Raj Rawal and Anne Marie Miller

Robert Russell Memorial Foundation

Jack Chester Foundation

THE EDUCATION FUND

FOR EXCELLENCE IN MIAMI-DADE PUBLIC SCHOOLS

Apply for an Ideas with IMPACT Adapter Grant!

All Miami-Dade County public school teachers, media specialists, counselors, or assistant principals may request funds to implement any project idea, teaching strategy, or project from the 2018 Idea EXPO workshops and/or curriculum ideas profiled annually in the ***Ideas with IMPACT*** catalogs from 1990 to the current year, 2018-19. Most catalogs can be viewed on The Education Fund's website at educationfund.org under "Ideas with IMPACT Catalog Publications."

- Open to all K-12 M-DCPS teachers, counselors, media specialists
- Quick and easy reporting requirements
- Grants range from $150 - $400
- Grant recipients recognized at an Awards Reception

To apply, you must contact the teacher who developed the idea before submitting your application. Contact can be made by attending a workshop given by the Disseminator, communicating via email or telephone, by visiting the Disseminator in their classroom, or by having the Disseminator visit your classroom.

Project funds are to be spent within the current school year or an extension may be requested. An expense report with receipts is required by Monday, June 3, 2019.

APPLICATION DEADLINE:
December 13, 2018

Apply online at educationfund.org

For more information, contact:
Audrey Onyeike, Program Director
305.558.4544, ext. 113
audrey@educationfund.org